

For Private Circulation Only



PARSI JUNCTION

Sunday, 5 July 2020

► Volume 1 ► Issue 37
► Year 1 ► Copy 37 ► Pages 8

Committed to Transparency and Accountability

ONCE AGAIN THUNDERS PHIROZE AMROLIWALLA PRACTISE WHAT YOU PREACH, KERSI RANDERIA

Since the last two weeks there has been a vituperative exchange of mails between Kersi Randeria and Phiroze Amroliwalla which took an ugly turn last week when Kersi Randeria took advantage of his own paper and made the exchange defamatory by publishing on the first page of his personally owned Parsi Times and published lies and fabricated statements defaming Phiroze Amroliwalla in the Parsi Times issue of Saturday 27th June 2020.

It all started with the demand of Phiroze Amroliwalla to provide free food to a senior resident of Khan Estate, one Mr. Bodhanwalla when the BPP under the leadership of the Acting Chairman Mrs. Armaity Tirandaz and her colleague Trustees started a community kitchen from Cama Baug from May 2020 for those who were unable to cook or go to bazaar to purchase their daily rations due to the pandemic lockdown.

Though Amroliwalla pointed out that the BPP has taken reversion of Bodhanwalla's Khan Estate flat back to BPP on his demise and hence the least the Trustees could do was to provide him free food from the community kitchen which was agreed by all other Trustees but unfortunately based on a report of one of their staff, Kersi Randeria peremptorily replied that

as there was no response to the staffs phone calls to Bodhanwalla, and hence he replied "this closes the case, Kersi".

Amroliwalla charged that he was depriving a poor needy Parsi of free food only because he had made the request and due to Randeria's enmity with him, Bodhanwalla was made a victim. This upset Kersi Randeria so much that he started attacking Amroliwalla on a personal level that if he paid the outstanding rent of over Rs. 2 lakhs than Randeria could feed more poor.

The exchange of mails led to Amroliwalla exposing Randeria's double talk of not surrendering his kaka's flat in Contractor Building, Byculla by not shifting his mother to his large Dadar Parsi Colony flat but instead transferring it to his mothers name and adding his sisters son's name, who resides in Godrej Baug Flat S-3, as person residing there to keep his legal right of the Contractor bldg. flat whilst he expects lesser mortals to surrender their family flat back to BPP under similar circumstances.

Randeria then charged Amroliwalla of not paying rent since 2017 to which Amroliwalla countered that he was willing to pay the lawful rent but Randeria had instructed the

Manager of all Baugs and colonies not to accept rent if the additional service charges of Rs. 750/ pm levied from January 2017 was also not paid. Ultimately Amroliwalla directly sent in January 2020, lawful payable rent from January 2017 to December 2019 for Rs. 1,03,939/ by cheque dated 27-1-2020 but the same was not encashed but kept in the drawer of the cashier under his instructions as it did not include the extra demand of Rs. 750/ pm. Amroliwalla agreed to pay the lawful rent, service charges, parking charges and one months extra rent upto June 2020 but refused to pay the illegal demand of Rs. 750/ pm and challenged him to take him to Court if it was legally due. Amroliwalla is right that the additional service charges of Rs. 750/ pm is illegal else why has Randeria not filed a suit for recovery of this demand since last over three years.

Randeria is well aware of the illegality of his demand of additional service charges of Rs. 750/ pm and if the Court struck it down in Amroliwalla's case than he would not be able to recover from the 80% of the tenants who are paying it at present.

Against Randeri's calculation of outstanding rent of Rs. 2,15,382/ upto June 2020

including the extra service charges of Rs. 750/pm, Amroliwalla agreed to immediately pay Rs. 1,20,882/ being the lawful rent and refused to pay the difference of Rs. 94,500/ being the illegal levy of additional service charges of Rs. 750x42monthsx3flats=Rs. 94,500.

If this demand is legal than RANDERIA SHOULD FILE A SUIT FOR ITS RECOVERY or admit it is an unlawful levy and stop its recovery for all tenants.

Kersi Randeria than attacked Amroliwalla that he was trying to make money from charity by selling his Khareghat Colony flat. We fail to understand that if Cusrow Baug, Rustom Baug, Ness Baug as also other Baug Tenants are allowed to encash the Tenancy value of their flat on surrender on 50:50 basis why should the same principle not be followed for every Tenant of every BPP colony. **In fact the Government of Maharashtra has made Pugree legal since 1999-2000 giving a right to every occupant of every flat in Maharashtra to share in the proceeds of the encashable value of his Tenancy with the landlord. This means that every occupant of every flat in all the BPP Baugs and Colonies has a legal right to share the tenancy value of his flat with the Trust then who is Randeria to deny this right to every occupant of a BPP flat.**

Getting frustrated by Amroliwalla's exposure of the transfer of the late kaka's Byculla flat to his mother's name instead of surrendering it back to BPP by taking his mother to reside with him in his large flat in DPC, Randeria then resorted to maligning the reputation of Amroliwalla in his personally owned paper Parsi Times by resorting to repetition of lies and fabrication of further allegations to which Amroliwalla sent a Notice email to the Editor, Printer, Publisher and Owner of Parsi Times that he is preparing his reply to the defamatory article in Parsi Times of 27th June 2020 and to publish his reply as prominently on the first page as the Editor had published Randeria, the Owners article. We give below both the mails of Amroliwalla addressed to all of them as also to the Trustees of BPP.

Unfortunately as the Owner Kersi Randeria has deprived Phiroze Amroliwalla the right to give his reply in the Parsi Times of 4-7-2020 and has not published the same in his paper so that his side of the story will not be allowed to be placed before the community. Of course in view of the gross injustice being done by Kersi Randeria we will publish his reply to the

news article in Parsi Times of 27-06-2020 so that the community becomes aware how Kersi Randeria uses his paper only to pander his own ego and run down others without giving them a chance to rebut what he prints in his paper like a Dictator. We publish below Amroliwalla's rebuttal of all the charges levied in Parsi Times of 27-06-2020 and refusing to print his reply in Parsi Times of 04-07-2020.

"From

Phiroze Amroliwalla

To **Kersi Randeria anahita@parsi-times.com mailparsitimes@gmail.com**

Cc Yazdi Desai Yazdi Desai armaity tirandaz Noshir - CAP Kersi Randeria Viraf Mehta "Xerxes V. Dastur" aspi sarkari Bpp Shenaz Khambatta Khambatta dinshaw dinshaw Phiroze Amroliwalla

Today at 12:12 PM 02-07-2020

To,

KERSI JAMSHED RANDERIA, ZUBEEN MURAD KERSI RANDERIA, Directors, PARSI TIMES MULTIMEDIA PRIVATE LIMITED

MAZDA HOUSE, BEHIND ACP'S OFFICE LBS MARG GHATKOPAR (WEST) MUMBAI Mumbai City MH 400086 IN E-mail: ahuramazda_ho@hotmail.

ANAHITA SUBEDAR, EDITOR, PARSI TIMES, 2nd.floor, Khaitan Chambers C.H.S. Ltd, 143-145, Mody Street, Fort Mumbai 400 001.

E-mail: anahita@parsi-times.com

CYRUS FIROZ PRINTER, PRINTER AND PUBLISHER, PARSI TIMES MULTIMEDIA PRIVATE LIMITED, 2nd.floor, Khaitan Chambers C.H.S. Ltd, 143-145, Mody Street, Fort Mumbai 400 001.

E-mail: mailparsitimes@gmail.com

Sirs and Madame,

On Saturday, June 27, 2020, you in your capacities described above, jointly and severally aided and abetted director/owner Kersi Randeria, who is at present also a trustee of the Bombay Parsi Punchayet, by carrying, printing and publishing on the front page a lead story which continued on page two as well, ordinarily reserved for the Editorial which was relegated to page five to accommodate the owner.

Your owner Mr. Kersi Randeria's sole intention is to silence my protests for his various acts of commission and omission

as a trustee of the BPP and has nothing to do in this matter with the "Parsi Times". **He has misused his position as owner of Parsi Times to humiliate and show me in poor light before the readers especially my community by publishing completely false, derogatory, defamatory, and libelous words. This is a gross misuse of the freedom of the press to settle scores with me for his differences with me as a trustee of the Bombay Parsi Punchayet.** He has suppressed the real facts and has not had the courage to print the truth of my so called "malicious and unfounded lies" and the "twisted and dishonest stories".

If at all the story was in the public interest, since it cast aspersions and false allegations against an individual, it was the duty of the Editor of the newspaper to verify the allegations before going into print. Merely because Randeria happens to be the owner does not entitle him to use the media as it pleases.

I will shortly email you the facts as they happened and not the fabricated version of Mr. Kersi Randeria and expect that you will print my email in the coming issue. If anyone or all of you wish to verify my submissions you are welcome to call me on my cell 9820062323.

I now expect you will print my reply email in your issue this week in its entirety without any edition, deletion, distortion, or alteration and carry it on the front page as you did your owner's version with an apology for blemishing my name and reputation.

Phiroze Amroliwalla"

ON THE SAME DAY AFTER A FEW HOURS, AMROLIWALLA SENT HIS DETAILED REPLY TO THEM WITH A REQUEST TO PUBLISH IT IN THIS SATURDAY'S PARSI TIMES ISSUE OF 4TH JULY 2020, WHICH IS GIVEN BELOW.

"For Favour of Publication: My response to Kersi Randeria's allegations.

From

Phiroze Amroliwalla

To: **anahita@parsi-times.com Kersi Randeria mailparsitimes@gmail.com**

Cc Yazdi Desai Yazdi Desai armaity tirandaz

Noshir - CAP Kersi Randeria Viraf Mehta "Xerxes V. Dastur" aspi sarkari Bpp Shenaz Khambatta Khambatta dinshaw dinshaw Phiroze Amroliwalla

4 hours ago at 1:54 AM 02-07-2020

Madame Editor, Parsi Times.

Subsequent to my earlier email, I now reply to the vituperative attack by your paper's owner Kersi Randeria in your paper Parsi Times dated June 27, 2020.

As stated in my earlier email to you as Editor, and the owners and printer and publisher, I now expect that you will print my reply in its entirety without editing, deleting, or in any way changing the contents, and with the same importance and as prominently on the front page as you did print the false and defamatory allegations by your owner last week.

Phiroze Amroliwalla

My response to Kersi Randeria's allegations.

TRUTH DELIVERED WEEKLY—That is what the Masthead of the Parsi Times proclaims boldly!

That is the biggest hoax the "Parsi Times" plays on our gullible community which laps down reports week after week of what its owner, the Parsi Times Multimedia Pvt. Ltd., Director/Owner Kersi Randeria wishes to publish **with an eye on promoting himself to further his prospects as a trustee of the BPP**. After becoming a trustee of the BPP he has silenced any criticism of himself and the BPP by the acquiring of the Editorial rights of another community weekly too and has thus gained control over the full Parsi Media. Any other publication which dares to come out with the true facts is dubbed as a "Sunday-rag" and "Yellow journalism". Kersi just does not tolerate dissent, cannot accept reality, and does not like to see his face in the mirror because he can't see his own reflection of the dark ugly truth!

Randeria forgets that he is ONLY one Trustee among equals, of the SEVEN elected by the community AND WHO ARE JOINTLY AND SEVERALLY ACCOUNTABLE for their actions. It is common knowledge that his writ prevails over not just the BPP and its staff, many of whom are appointed by him through his business connections and are thus subservient to him alone, but also beneficiaries living in Parsi colonies and

baugs. **He is better known as the de-facto Chairman and also for brushing aside his co-trustees too since his election in 2015, which allegedly was under a cloud due to the use of the EVM's. With Kersi Randeria, it is "My Way or the Highway".**

His most recent diktat was in the case of one Mr. Bodhanwala who lives alone in Khan Estate and is absolutely deserving of the free food helpline of the BPP and instead of serving the free meal, with Randeria's vindictive attitude towards me, Bodhanwala was denied the free meal by a short order by his Lordship Randeria: "This closes the issue", only because the request was not routed through him. How dare the four other trustees give an assurance that the matter will be reviewed!

In his diatribe in your PT of June 27, he describes me as "a certain Phiroze Amroliwalla". Records will show that we have known each other for over 20 years from the days when Randeria started his "activism" around the early 2000s and only on the community front with a non-registered outfit called AZA; unlike me who was actively associated with well-known institutions such as the Indian Merchant's Chamber, WIAA, Bombay Civic Trust, ZRUCC of the Western and Central Railways etc., assisting all sections of society with consumer and social issues be it the then telephone service provider MTNL, railways, BEST, Traffic and transportation and BPP was just one of them.

So as not to bore the reader, I intend to share with the community and **demonstrate by unmasking the real Kersi Randeria from his "Dr. Jekyll and Mr. Hyde" personality**. For a start, I will demolish all his rantings and ravings about me and the total fabrication and misrepresentation of true facts.

The readers must know that while Kersi Randeria has dwelt at length on my "three flats", **Randeria has very conveniently suppressed my accusations against the sly and surreptitious transfer of his late Kaka's huge flat in Contractor Bldg., Byculla, a BPP charity property, after he became a Trustee of the BPP, to the name of his mother. His mother at present lives with his sister, in a Godrej Baug flat, thus keeping the Byculla flat in his possession, though he has**

a large 1500 sqft. ownership flat on the entire floor in Dadar Parsi Colony where he could very conveniently and comfortably accommodate his mother as well. He has also included the name of his sister's son in the Byculla flat obviously with an ulterior motive.

Kersi Randeria refers to my "illegally occupied a SECOND flat next door to his flat in Mahim". Kersi Randeria has referred to the notice dated 29, May 2019. I draw his and the readers' attention to para 2 page 2 of the very notice from the BPP which states "My clients state that the tenant Ms. Mani K. Patel passed away on 19th Sept. 2006 leaving behind her nephew Mr. Phiroze C. Amroliwalla as her sole surviving heir and legal representative as above mentioned". Mr. Randeria, this notice from the lawyers of the BPP acknowledges my legal status, so are you challenging your own lawyers' notice by telling your readers that I am in illegal possession of the premises where I have been living for nearly thirty-five years? These notices which despite being received and acknowledged were thereafter maliciously pasted on our front doors with the sole intention to discredit and defame me before visitors and among my co-residents in Mahim.

With regards to the Khareghat flat and Kersi Randeria's accusation that I tried to bribe him, the reality is that he tried to bribe me when he called me to Farmer Bros. at Khodadad Circle Dadar, on a Sunday afternoon in March 2017 for discussion on the extra service charge issue when he offered to waive these charges for my three flats if I withdrew my public protests against the increased service charges. When I declined his offer, he even volunteered to facilitate the sale of the Khareghat Flat as per the terms agreed upon by the previous board and recorded in the minutes dated August 20, 2013, a copy of which is in my possession thanks to him. Is that called an attempt by me to bribe him? If that be the reality then I accuse him of being corrupt. Why did he come to meet me on a Sunday? Did he expect that I will bribe him? Did he then come to collect the Bribe?

He then called me on Sunday, May 7, 2017, which was his wedding anniversary day,

when **we met again at his insistence**, but this time I refused to travel to Dadar so we met at Café Coffee Day at Mahim as a follow-up to the Dadar meeting. Logically if as he alleges I wanted to bribe him, why would he come to Mahim? Or was he hoping that I would bribe him and that he is corrupt and that is why he even agreed to come to Mahim on his Anniversary day on his motor bike (whose photos I have as proof thereof) when I could have gone to Dadar, correct?

To reassure me and at my insistence, these offers were repeated by him in the presence of late Trustee Zarir Bhathena and Trustee Noshir Dadrawala at Grand Maratha at Lalbaug on the 24/25 May 2017. While I declined his offer of a waiver of the increased service charges only in my case, we agreed that the BPP will offer waiver/subsidy to all needy and deserving cases after which I proceeded to Toronto for my post-surgery rehabilitation. My letter in the PT of May 27, 2017, confirms this.

He has stated that because of my surgery in Canada my son is in a "FINANCIAL DRAIN". Here I must mention that Kersi Randeria should be better informed, that in Canada, health benefits are provided entirely free by the government even to those sponsored by their children and therefore my son has NOT BEEN PUT TO ANY "FINANCIAL DRAIN". I repeat that Kersi Randeria tried to buy me out by offering to facilitate the sale of not only the Khareghat flat but also the Mahim flat. He suggested that I keep one flat for my visits to Mumbai. I repeat my wife and I spend more time in Mumbai every year than in Toronto. And why this selective approach when there are hundreds of other flats which are continuously locked for the last several years and no action is taken on such violators?

If BPP allows Tenants/Occupants of Cusrow Baug, Rustom Baug and other Baugs to share in the encashable value of his tenanted flat on its surrender on 50:50 basis, I fail to understand why I should be deprived of the same facility especially since the earlier Board in 2013 had already agreed to the same. Besides, the Government of Maharashtra has made Pugree legal since 1999-2000 giving a right to every occupant of every flat in Maharashtra to share in the proceeds

of the encashable value of his Tenancy with the landlord. This means that every occupant of every flat in all the BPP Baugs and Colonies has a legal right to share the encashable tenancy value of his flat with the Trust then who is Randeria to deny this right to every occupant of a BPP flat.

As regards his concern for the poor, as a trustee he should set an example by surrendering his Byculla flat by taking his mother to reside with him, instead of which he got the rent receipt transferred to his mother's name, though she is residing with his sister in a Godrej Baug flat which again was given to his sister also free of all charges. In fact he should even buy his sister an Ownership flat and surrender their Godrej Baug flat back to BPP to allot to some deserving family or give it under the Refundable Deposit Scheme so that many poor can be looked after from its proceeds aside from paying salary to its own staff on time.

Thus his whole family takes advantage of free charity flats though he is a multi millionaire and he has the gumption to accuse me of wanting to make money from charity.

Since he claims he is very concerned for the poor, will he make available to the community a complete list of all the flats that have been allotted, to whom and on what terms since this Board took charge from Oct.2015? For three years Randeria treated even his three colleague Trustees as Untouchables till they got relief from the High Court. **I reiterate, that this Board has allotted flats at random, on an ad-hoc basis, to their favored few without following due laid down procedures as per a Merit Rating system which, Kersi Randeria insisted that earlier Boards follow, after scrutiny by a Housing Advisory Committee. Why these double standards Randeria? You as a so-called activist expect accountability from others but shy away when it comes to your own actions!**

As far as his allegations of my connections with the underworld go, unlike him I do not need any help of such people and I have broad shoulders to bear my cross. He forgets that people with whom he is associated and has been dealing with are either wanted in the UAE, Punjab or Haryana by the police and other agencies.

With regard to the second false accusation that we do not pay rents, the fact is, that on January 27, 2020, we had sent a cheque for all legally payable dues up to December 2019, by Registered Post A.D. after several futile attempts to pay the dues through the Custodians, who have been instructed not to accept rent from us and all those who do not pay the unjustified and illegal demand of an extra Rs. 750/- pm as additional service charges irrespective of the size, the number of rooms, the area, the location, and the services provided. This is a backdoor method employed to circumvent the Maharashtra Rent Control Act 1999 which prohibits a landlord from increasing rents more than 4% annually. Earlier boards used to request residents to voluntarily share and supplement the BPP's efforts to meet with rising costs and the Amroliwallas have not only happily complied but have made donations several times. We are ready willing and eager to pay all legal dues but refuse to pay the unfair increase in Service charges of Rs. 750/pm. Kersi Randeria should file suit against me for non-payment of rent. Why has he not done so for last over three years? Because the demand is illegal.

To prove Randeria's brazen defiance and disregard for his colleague trustees' views on this, I can share the exchange of WhatsApp messages dt. May 4, 2017 wherein trustee Noshir Dadrawala has quoted late trustee Zarir Bhathena, who said that "there is no application of mind". Noshir, while addressing Kersi said: "I seldom differ with you....but on this matter, by now I am convinced we have goofedlet us show courage and statesmanship". Let all know that Noshir has despite pressure from Kersi Randeria stood up to him more than once and has also faced the wrath of Kersi Randeria. His "my way or the highway" is also demonstrated when, despite a resolution to reduce the service charges to Rs.350/ pm, which was tabled well over a year ago by four trustees-- Armaity Tirandaz, Noshir Dadrawala, Viraf Mehta and Xerxes Dastur has been shelved with help from his favored staff by ONLY ONE trustee Kersi Randeria.

Is this how any democratic institution should function? Why and how does our community and his co-trustees allow ONE MAN TO DOMINATE a community institution?

I reserve all my other rights and to continue with more facts at a later date.

Phiroze Amroliwalla

SHIFTING OF PARSİ GATE



In the Parsi Junction issue no. 34 dated 14-06-2020, we had published the proposal of BMC to shift/reconstruct the Parsi Gate, at present opposite the Taraporewalla Aquarium, Marine Drive, at their entire cost, about a kilometer south towards International Hotel opposite Bharat Mahal at Marine Drive due to the Coastal Road and a tunnel passing below the present location of Parsi Gate.

Maneck Dastur of Godrej Baug and the Municipal Insurance Agent of BMC employees was contacted by the officials of the Coastal Road project to help them co-ordinate with concerned Parsi activists so that the work proceeds without any hindrance. Maneck Dastur contacted ex-Chairman of Bombay Parsi Punchayet (BPP) who advised him to involve the Trustees of BPP which is the apex Trust of the Parsi community and whose Trustees are the Akabars of the community.

To keep the concerned members and activists of the community also in the loop, Dinshaw Mehta mailed the proposal of the said shifting, along with the plans of existing Parsi Gate as well as the new location to Rayomand/Khushru Zaiwalla, Zoru Bhatena, Arzan Ghadially and several others. For ease of recollection we are re-publishing the said mail of Dinshaw Mehta and the reply of Rayomand Zaiwalla as under:

Dinshaw Mehta then forwarded the mail of Maneck Dastur along with the relocation plan to several Parsi activists who could contribute to the project **without creating hurdles in it**. The said mail is reproduced below for community knowledge: "Parsi Gate Relocation at Marine Drive

"From dinshaw dinshaw To Arzan Ghadially, Nauzer Bharucha, rayomand zaiwala, zoru bhatena Cc burjor antia, berjis desai, hoshi dastur, Viraf, Dinshaw Rusi Mehta, MANECK DASTUR, Jehangir Patel, kersi commissariat, kersi limathwalla,

Dasturjikhurshed, parvezbajan, Maneck Engineer, tzmladministration, dara s acidwalla, NoshirDadrawala, hector mehta

Date Tue 09-06-2020 22:55

DEAR ALL,
AS YOU ARE AWARE, THE COASTAL ROAD IS TO START FROM THE PRINCESS STREET FLYOVER, FOR WHICH THE HERITAGE PARSİ GATE, OPPOSITE THE TARAPOREWALLA AQUARIUM, HAS TO BE SHIFTED UPWARDS. THOUGH IT BELONGS TO NO ONE BUT THE BMC, CONSIDERING IT AS A HOLY HERITAGE SITE FOR PARSİS, BMC HAS INVITED A FEW PARSİS FOR ITS PLAN OF SHIFTING FULLY AT BMC COST THROUGH THEIR INSURANCE AGENT MANECK DASTUR, WHO HAS BEEN KIND ENOUGH TO SEND ME THE PROPOSED PLAN OF SITE TO BE SHIFTED. SINCE ALL OF YOU ARE COMMUNITY ACTIVISTS, IN THE INTEREST OF TRANSPARENCY, I AM FORWARDING THE ATTACHED PLAN AND REQUEST YOU TO GO THROUGH THE PLAN AS WELL AS THE TRAILING MAIL AND IF YOU HAVE ANY SUGGESTIONS OR ADVICE FOR ITS BETTER IMPLEMENTATION DO LET MANECK OR ME KNOW AT THE INITIAL STAGE ITSELF, SO THAT THE WORK CAN BE EXPEDITED.

WITH WARM REGARDS,
DINSHAW MEHTA"

THATVERYNIGHTTHEFIRSTRESPONSE CAME FROM RAYOMAND ZAIWALLA AS UNDER:

Parsi Gate Relocation at Marine Drive

"From Rayomand cursetjee

To Arzan Ghadially , Nauzer Bharucha , zoru bhatena , dinshaw dinshaw Cc burjor antia, berjis desai, hoshi dastur, Viraf, Dinshaw Rusi Mehta, MANECK DASTUR,

Jehangir Patel, kersi commissariat, kersi limathwalla, Dasturjikhurshed, parvezbajan, Maneck Engineer, tzmladministration, dara s acidwalla, NoshirDadrawala, hector mehta

Date Tue 09-06-2020 23:26

Dinshaw Uncle,

Thank you for the email . Some time ago, we had put BMC to notice regarding the Parsi Gate , which could be harmed in case the Coastal Road project starts digging at Princess Street. They were kind enough to give us a written undertaking that they will re-establish the Parsi Gate once the Coastal Road project is completed at Princess Street. Will be very obliged if the physical print copy of their proposed plans with official bmc stamp can be sent to us, so that in future they keep their word.

Kind regards.

Rayomand"

Whilst most of the other activists were in favor of the said shifting if done at full BMC cost, Zoru Bhatena by his mail of 9-6-2020 also expressed in favor of the proposal but further advised that since there are tetrapods at the new site with no access to the sea waters, BMC should provide access to the sea waters by removing the tetrapods at the new location.

Arzan J. Ghadially also in favor of the shifting informed by his mail of 10-6-2020 that it is reported in the Indian Express of 21-05-2019, the structure would be temporarily shifted so coastal road work could proceed as there is a tunnel construction at the gate on which the pillars stand and after the work is completed the gate would be restored on the same site. He further went on to advise that

"Prima facie there is no record or history linking 'Parsi Gate' to the community. In case there is, please share .The only history linking Parsi Gate to Parsi's is that it was erected by Parsi's and the only significance attached to it is that parsis go there to pray on AVAROZ . If that be so than location change does not matter. Having said that the BMC is requested to give an undertaking that they would take care while migrating the structure even temporarily and not to be considered as an endorsement."

Subsequently, Maneck Dastur sent WhatsApp message to Dinshaw Mehta on Thursday 25th June 2020 that

"Chithore, the Director of Coastal Road Development, wants to meet the Trustees of the Parsi Punchayet with me at the site of the new relocation. Please can you initiate

and let me know the date. The Coastal Road department has suggested 30th at 4.30 pm as the date and location opposite Al-Sabah Court. Is it all right?"

Dinshaw Mehta after consulting the majority Trustees confirmed the date and time to Maneck Dastur, who requested that Dinshaw Mehta should also attend and even sent him an epass issued by Sanjay Sawant, the Executive Engineer (Head Quarter), BMC. However Dinshaw Mehta was in Lonavla with all his three sons and their wives and grandchildren as one of his grand-daughter was in her seventh month of pregnancy and as per advice of her gynecologist Dr. Mrs. Anahita Pundole they had all shifted to a safer location to their Lonavla bungalow as there was not a single covid case there in spite of the raging covid pandemic in Mumbai. Hence Dinshaw Mehta could not attend the 30th June meeting keeping in mind the horrible traffic jam at all entry points to Mumbai, the day before.

On 30th June 2020 at 4.30 pm the BMC officials of the coastal road met at the new proposed site opposite Kishco Cutlery showroom at Al Sabah Court when only Maneck Dastur, Viraf Mehta, Xerxes Dastur and Zoru Bhathena were the only Parsi representatives present.

As per discussions with the officials who showed the site where the Parsi Gate was proposed to be shifted, it was pointed out by Zoru Bhathena that the site per se was acceptable but BMC would have to remove the tetrapods located there and steps would have to be constructed so as to provide access to the sea water. The BMC Officials assured that the needful would be done.

Trustee Viraf Mehta pointed out that earlier the BMC had proposed to only temporarily shift the Parsi Gate and once tunnel work was done, the gate would be reinstalled at its original location opposite Taraporewalla Aquarium. The BMC officials explained that aside from the tunnel, the coastal road of three lanes on either side would be abutting the present Parsi Gate and hence the sea would be at least 100 to 200 feet away and hence access to the sea water would be very difficult especially for the Seniors of our community and hence reinstallation at the original location would not be in their interests. This explanation was found logical by all and hence the new location was accepted as a better alternative.

At this juncture it is important to inform the dissidents and the nay sayers of our community that Zoru Bhathena has per

se objected to the coastal road project and has filed Writ Petition against it in the Mumbai High Court and has even moved the Supreme Court against it but on the proposal of shifting the Parsi Gate to the new location he and the others found it to be a viable and acceptable proposition. We give below his report/feedback in his own words on the new site visit which is as under:

"Today we had a short site visit to the proposed location for shifting the Parsi Gate on Marine Drive.

BMC (Heritage & Coastal Rd teams) informed that they propose to move the gate to this spot- opp Al Sabah Court Bldg, Marine Drive.

BMC said they will re-erect the gate here + provide access to the sea water.

All those who attended found the location & plan in order.

Maneck Dastur, Trustee Xerxes Dastur, Trustee Viraf Mehta and Zoru Bhathena were present."

Surprisingly the details of the meeting were announced by Free Press Journal who interviewed Dinshaw Mehta and Zoru Bhathena. Since the relocation is of community interest we are publishing the said FPJ article as under:



MUMBAI FREE PRESS JOURNAL

Updated on: Thursday, July 2, 2020, 6:00 AM IST

Parsi Gate to be shifted permanently

By Dipti Singh

The structure will be shifted almost a kilometre away to facilitate ongoing construction of the coastal road project on the stretch.

Mumbai: The Brihanmumbai Municipal Corporation all set to shift the century-old

'Parsi Gate' on Marine Drive permanently to another location almost a kilometre away. The decision to shift the two pillars called Parsi Gate to make way for construction of the ambitious coastal road project.

The civic body had recently approached the members of the community seeking their suggestions and objections. However, the members of the community have not objected to the move.

"Even though the place is known to have been visited by Parsis for around a century to offer prayers, it actually belongs to the BMC. I appreciate the fact that the civic body considered the religious sentiments of the community before taking a decision. Nobody has objected to the move so far," said Dinshaw Mehta, former chairman of Bombay Parsi Punchayet (BPP).

Parsi Gate, which members of the community use to reach a narrow strip of beach to offer prayers to water, is at a spot opposite Taraporewalla Aquarium where the coastal road's north-bound tunnel is planned. Members of the community gather at Parsi Gate, a 19th-century structure, during 'Avaroz', the day observed by Parsis in the month of March every year to venerate water.

The BMC now plans to shift the structure permanently a kilometre away opposite Bharat Mahal on Marine Drive so that work on the project can proceed.

Parsi Gate comprises two almost 5 m pillars made of stone on concrete pedestals. The style of construction is said to be based on ancient Persian architecture. "It was constructed over a hundred years ago. Parsis pray there on certain days. It is one of the few sites where our community offers prayers in the open," said a member of the community.

According to sources close to the community, members of the community including trustees of Bombay Parsi Punchayet met the BMC officials on June 8 where they were shown the spot where the structure will be shifted.

Social Activist and a member of the community Zoru Bhathena pointed out that new proposed location where the structure will be shifted will need alterations. He said, "The existing gate is located to the North of Princess Street Flyover. This stretch of Marine Drive has a sandy beach and had access to the sea waters.

While the proposed location which is to the south of Princess Street Flyover, this stretch of Marine Drive has Tetrapods, with no access to the sea waters. Hence, along with shifting of the gate, some provision will have to be made to give access to the seawater such as ramps, piers and set of steps."

Mehta added, "The civic body has agreed to the suggestions of allowing access to the waters. Also objecting to the shifting of the gate makes no sense as there will be three-lane traffic coming between the gate and the sea, community members will not have access to the water in future once the project is completed. Hence shifting the gate is the solution as far as we get access to the waters as we had in the original structure."

When contacted a senior BMC official said, "Only once the project develops, will we see what would be done around the Parsi Gate. We are in touch with community members. As of now, I cannot comment about the relocation of the structure or give any details of work that would be carried out there," said the official."

SINCE THE PARSIGATE BELONGS TO THE BMC AND NOT TO THE PARSIS COMMUNITY, THEIR OFFER TO RELOCATE AND RECONSTRUCT THE PARSIGATE AT THEIR ENTIRE COST WAS APPRECIATED BY ALL. WHILST MOST COMMUNITY MEMBERS WELCOMED THE PROPOSAL, A FEW DISSENTING VOICES WERE ALSO THERE OF WHICH THE USUAL SAROSH ZAIWALLA WAS AT THE FOREFRONT.

In his mail of 9-6-2020, Zaiwalla was keen to have the Parsi Gate restored back at its original location after the tunnel work is over. But as explained at the meeting of 30-6-2020 when it was pointed out that reconstruction at the same site was not conducive to our senior members as the access to the sea waters would shift further than 100 feet away, hence the Parsis present on 30-6-2020 meeting felt the new location was much better if the tetrapods were removed and access staircase to the sea water was provided.

However on 3rd July 2020 he sent the below mail to the Trustees of the BPP:

“**From:** Rayomandcursetjee<cursetjee72@hotmail.com>
Sent: Friday, July 3, 2020 10:42 AM To, The Trustees, Bombay Parsi Panchayat.

Sir,
 It is said that History repeats itself, because Man makes the same mistakes. The BPP Trustees has fallen into the same trap by readily agreeing to desecration of the Parsi Gate, a place of worship dedicated to Goddess Ava for more than 100 years . To make the matter worse, the BPP Trustees for small gains and for two minutes of fame, have agreed to a reconstruction of a site towards Churchgate in the direct line of the monsoon winds and the gale , which every year claims without fail, number of lives of innocent victims , mostly those sitting on the dykes or walking on Marine Drive.

With the eyes wide open the Trustees have agreed to so called relocation without any application of mind, much less the safety of the worshippers .The BPP Trustees failed to point out to the BMC Authorities, that there is ample area available from Bandstand at Walkeshwar to Birla Kreedha Kendra and Mafatlal Hindu Swimming pool and the beach thereafter which is cordoned off by BMC at present to be used as a fabrication plant area and even further to the vicinity of the Parsi Gate, as available space for temporary relocation , if at all, which is indeed unfortunate.

With Goodwill towards all, History has a regular habit of repeating itself. Some years ago, a Ambika Dhara Devi Temple on an island on a Bhagarathi river in Uttarkhand was demolished and the Deity was cut into half to be shifted for relocation elsewhere to make way for a dam on Bhagarathi River , inspite of objections by the General public . It must be remembered that on the very night of the demolition of the temple, a heavy cloudburst destroyed all habitation leading to casualties of ten thousand plus people.

The Parsi Gate is dedicated to the worship of Ava Ardevishur also known as Anahita , and Amba and Ambika in Vedic faiths . Some years ago a mighty tidal wave destroyed the city of Galle on the Southern most tip of Sri Lanka, killing over 50,000 in minutes which included five members of a Parsi family. Such is the fury of the Mother Goddess. It's a holy Indian tradition not to desecrate any holy place for variety of reasons . We hope and pray that the BPP Trustees and their camp followers do not take part in the desecration in any manner and preserve the Religious Heritage in a manner as suggested above.

The BPP Trustees would do well to remember the eternal words of William

Shakespeare, namely , " THERE ARE MORE THINGS IN THIS HEAVEN AND EARTH , THEN DREAMT OF IN YOUR PHILOSOPHY ."

Khushru Zaiwala”

From what we could understand from Khushru Zaiwala's objection is that the Parsi Gate should be shifted towards the other side that is between the present location and Walkeshwar along Chowpatty sea face and not the international hotel side which the BMC has proposed and Zoru Bhatena, Maneck Dastur and the Trustees have accepted. Perhaps Zaiwala is not aware that at Chowpatty the sea at low tide goes hundreds of feet away and hence access to the sea water for our seniors would pose a big problem. Further as explained by the officials three lanes each of coastal road on either side would take the sea further away and as accepted by those who attended the 30-06-2020 meeting the new location opposite Kishco Cutlery seems the most suitable under the circumstances and it would be in the fitness of development that he too accepted the new location instead of creating hurdles which in the long run would adversely affect the credibility of our community due to such non-cooperation by a few perhaps misinformed Parsis.

Aside from the Zaiwalla's, that permanent pest sitting in USA with a non-Parsi wife and calls his children as bastards, added fuel to the fire by attacking Zoru Bhatena for his favorable report on relocation of Parsi Gate. Zoru not one to be cowed by the likes of the USA scourge then posted on WhatsApp his earlier mail on him as under:

“Ah! My Dear Friend Baku is suffering from selective memory loss.

Let me try to refresh his memory.

Pl do pass on the message
 Thank You.”

Zoru then posted four WhatsApp messages of May 2019 which unfortunately are not conducive to copy and paste and hence are not available for community benefit. But Zoru Bhatena goes on to add as under:

“Ah!
 The Parsi Whatsapp Warriors are back again

The very warriors who make a hue & cry only after things are over

The very warriors who ignored all the messages about the proposed demolition of the Parsi Gate at Marine Drive (screen shots 1 to 4 dated 06.05.2019, 15.05.2019 & 15.05.2019)

An entire group, with hundreds of warriors keeping silent

But, after some kind person (not me) finds a solution and gets BMC to agree to move the gate to a 3rd location (instead of destroying it), these same whatsapp warriors get up and start their whatsapp war games!!

The same ones who were sleeping from atleast May 2019!!!

But, screen shot 5 (also dt 15.05.2019 on same group) helps to serve as a reminder about how all these whatsapp warriors work. i.e. close their eyes & ignore the issues when it needs to be looked into & wake up and fire away after the deed is done.

To all my WhatsApp Warrior friends; ask yourself what you did from May 2019 & atleast be honest enough to say Thank

You to some other good soul who took the trouble to save the structure from being demolished.

With Best Wishes to my WhatsApp Warrior friends,
Zoru””

But what was most heartening to find was that Arzan J Ghadially in reply to the critics of the approval given by the Trustees to the relocation of Parsi Gate was for the first time in support of Dinshaw Mehta but also called upon those who had valid grounds of objection to write to him and he would forward their say if reasonable to the appropriate authorities. His WhatsApp message is posted below:

“Farzan,
DRM invited a few activists to give their response. DRM was the only one who asked people to respond if there are objections. Even I was included in that mail. I gave my views and shared it on this group too.

Frankly without taking sides, the BPP

should have issued a write up in papers asking members of the community on their views. That did not happen. Had DRM not mailed, People would have never known about it . Today people are discussing this issue only because DRM raised it and others were silent. Please Correct me if I am wrong but One needs to be fair.

There is still time. Pl email all objections at the earliest at ‘arzanjg@gmail.com’ and I will forward all the objections to the concerned authorities from our community involved. Let the community voice be heard

Regards
Arzan J Ghadially”.

TIME WILL SHOW HOW THE BMC KEEPS ITS WORD TO MAKE PARSI DEVOTEES ACCESS TO THE SEA WATERS ON AVA ROZ. OF COURSE THAT ALSO DEPENDS HOW OUR COMMUNITY CO-OPERATES WITH BMC IN THE RELOCATION OF THE PARSI GATE.

Jiyo Parsi

Friday Forum 10 July 6-7 PM

In her talk “Are Emotions Friends or Foes?” Jayshree Mehta shares how Emotional Intelligence can empower us to conduct effective interpersonal communication and nurture healthy relationships, which can greatly improve the texture of our everyday lives. Jayshree Mehta is a life-skills trainer for teachers, students and parents. Through her two decade-long association with The Times of India, as well as in her independent capacity, she has conducted more than 3000 classroom workshops in over 150 schools. Her workshops attempt to deconstruct the often-heavy concepts surrounding behavioural studies into useful guidelines and accessible knowledge. Her goal has been to trigger self-awareness that will enable the parent, the teacher and the adolescent to navigate through their individual challenges. Have question beforehand to ask our experts, ask here: <https://forms.gle/yCpcbtLDpRKAF1618> Join us at: <https://bit.ly/JPlive3july>



सुमित्रा मेहता
MINISTRY OF MINORITY AFFAIRS
GOVERNMENT OF INDIA

JIYO
PARSI

Friday | July 10 | 6:00 PM - 7:00 PM

ARE EMOTIONS FRIENDS OR FOES?

Our speaker will share how Emotional Intelligence can empower us to conduct effective interpersonal communication and nurture healthy relationships, which can greatly improve the texture of our everyday lives.



Jayshree Mehta
Life-Skills Trainer

 **LIVE**

JOIN US LIVE ON FACEBOOK

 [jiyoparsi](https://www.facebook.com/jiyoparsi) | jiyoparsi151@gmail.com |